

**PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY**  
**Energy Efficiency 2018-2025 Rolling Portfolio Business Plan**  
**Application 17-01-015**  
**Data Response**

PG&E Data Request No.:	TURN_001-Q09		
PG&E File Name:	EnergyEfficiency2018-2025-RollingPortfolioBusinessPlan_DR_TURN_001-Q09		
Request Date:	February 17, 2017	Requester DR No.:	001
Date Sent:	March 6, 2017	Requesting Party:	The Utility Reform Network
PG&E Witness:	Chris Kato	Requester:	Hayley Goodson

**SUBJECT: PG&E 2018-2025 EE ROLLING PORTFOLIO BUSINESS PLAN & BUDGET. TURN DATA REQUEST TURN-PG&E-01.**

**STATEWIDE PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION**

**QUESTION 9**

The following questions pertain to the “Statewide Administration Approach” proposed jointly by PG&E, SCE, SoCalGas, and SDG&E, which appears as Appendix A to Chapter 11 in PG&E’s Business Plan.

- a. On page 2, the Joint IOUs point to the Commission’s desire to prioritize “lower transaction costs for PAs and implementers,” among other anticipated benefits of the new statewide program requirements. Does PG&E’s Business Plan budget request reflect a projection of lower transaction costs resulting from the proposed “Statewide Administration Approach”? If so, please quantify the cost reductions PG&E projects and explain where specifically in PG&E’s budget those reductions are captured in Table 1.5 (PG&E Portfolio Budget Summary) and Table 1.6 (PG&E Sector Budget Summary) in the Business Plan Chapter 1.
- b. On page 4, the Joint IOUs indicate that they considered specific factors in the marketplace in determining “natural bundling” of statewide programs, such as whether “different end uses or technologies require different skillsets, a different set of manufacturers, trade organizations, and distributors to engage.” The IOUs report, “This is particularly true in the area of lighting and HVAC where the suppliers and experts in each area are vastly different.”
  - i. Please provide a listing of all manufacturers whose lighting, HVAC, and PLA products are/were included in PG&E’s 2016 and 2017 portfolios.
  - ii. Please provide all research and analysis used by the Joint IOUs in assessing “natural bundling” opportunities, and specifically supporting the continued segregation of lighting, HVAC, and PLA end uses into distinct statewide programs, and assigning lighting to a different statewide administrator than HVAC and PLA.
- c. On page 4, the Joint IOUs’ mention their consideration of the historic cost-effectiveness of each PA in delivering each statewide program. Please clarify what year(s) of data were used by the Joint IOUs in this assessment and whether savings were IOU-reported gross savings or Energy Division’s ex post net savings.

## ANSWER 9

a. No, PG&E's business plan budget does not factor in any cost reductions associated with lower transaction costs resulting from the proposed statewide administration approach as PG&E does not have any analysis or bases to make those assumptions. However, PG&E supports in concept the Commission's desire to prioritize lower transaction costs for PAs and implementers. PG&E has factored in approximately \$35.4M (roughly 10%) in cost reductions over the years to account for outsourcing of implementation activities to third parties in general, and other operational efficiencies. Table 1.6 on page 29 of PG&E's Portfolio Overview chapter provides our estimated reductions per sector.

b. Please see answers below:

i.

**Lighting:** The following lighting manufacturers participated in 2016:

- Acuity/Lithonia Lighting
- Broada, Inc.\*
- Bulb Star\*
- Cordelia Lighting/Commercial
- Cree, Inc.
- Feit Electric
- Greenlite Lighting Corporation
- Halo/Cooper
- MaxLite
- Optolight\*
- Philips
- PLUSRITE
- Sunbeam\*
- Sunrise\*

In addition, the following are also approved to participate in 2017, but have not yet submitted a rebate application:

- Euri Lighting
- Hyperikon
- L'Image Home Products
- TCPI

\*While all of the manufacturers listed above provide LEDs, Broada, Bulbstar, Optolight, and Sunbeam provided both LEDs and CFLs in 2016. Sunrise is providing both LEDs and CFLs in 2017.

## **HVAC:**

Please see below for a list of all manufacturers that carry high efficiency equipment eligible for PG&E's Commercial HVAC Upstream program. This equipment includes unitary, water source heat pump, air-cooled chillers, and VRF (currently on hold pending a new work paper). The Commercial HVAC portfolio contains eligible higher efficiency equipment and not individual manufacturers. As a result, all manufacturers with qualifying equipment are eligible for the program. Manufacturers carrying eligible equipment include:

- Aaon
- Airquest
- Alliance
- Artichill
- American Standard
- Arcoaire
- Bard
- Bosch
- Bryant
- Carrier
- Champion
- Climate Master
- Coldflo
- Coleman
- ComfortMaker
- Daiken Mcquay
- Day & Night
- Enertech
- Evcon
- Energy Labs
- FHP
- Fraser Johnston
- Fujitsu
- GD Midea
- Geocool
- Geomaster
- Geosmart
- Geostar
- Goodman
- Guardian
- Heat Controller
- Heil
- ICP Commercial
- International Comfort Products
- Johnson Controls
- Kenmore
- Lennox Industries
- LG

- Luxaire
- Mammoth
- Maritime Geothermal
- Marvair
- Mitsubishi
- Multistack
- Northern Geo
- McQuay
- Omega
- Panasonic
- Payne
- Rheem
- Ruud
- Petra
- Samsung
- Sanyo
- Smardt
- Spectrum
- Tempmaster
- Terra Therm
- Toshiba
- Trane
- United Refrigeration
- Water Furnace
- Whalen
- Xenon
- York
- Zamil
- Zehner Rittling

**PLA:**

Please see below for manufacturers that are on PG&E's qualified product list (QPL) for the PLA program. This includes pool pumps, gas and electric water heaters, and RPP.

*Pool Pumps\**

- AquaPro Systems
- Fluidra USA
- Hayward
- Nidec
- Pentair
- Regal
- Speck Pumps
- Sta-rite
- Waterway Plastics, Inc.
- Zodiac

\*Please note that some larger manufacturers provide a product under multiple brand labels. When PG&E receives requests for incentives on an unknown brand, PG&E researches whether the product is identical to a qualified model, just under a different brand name.

*Gas and Electric Water Heaters\**

- A.O. Smith
- American
- American Standard
- Bosch
- Bradford White
- Craftmaster
- EcoSense
- GE
- Giant
- GREE
- GSW
- HTP
- Intellihot
- John Wood
- Kenmore
- Laars
- Lochinvar
- MDV, MIDEA
- Navien
- Noritz
- Paloma
- Paloma-WaiWela
- PHNIX
- Radiant
- Reliance
- Rheem
- Richmond
- Rinnai
- Ruud
- Sears
- Select
- State
- State Industries
- Stiebel Eltron
- Takagi
- Triangle Tube
- US Craftmaster
- Vaughn
- Vesta
- Westinghouse

- Whirlpool

\*Please note that some larger manufacturers provide a product under multiple brand labels. When PG&E receives requests for incentives on an unknown brand, PG&E researches whether the product is identical to a qualified model, just under a different brand name.

#### *Retail Products Platform*

- Amana
- Avanti
- Blueair
- Bosch
- Danby
- Electrolux
- Frigidaire
- GE
- Haier
- Honeywell
- Hotpoint
- Igloo
- Insignia
- Kenmore
- Keystone
- Kitchen Aid
- LG
- Magic Chef
- Maytag
- Midea
- Samsung
- Silhouette
- SPT
- Whirlpool
- Whynter

ii. PG&E considered multiple factors in putting forth the “natural leads with the capacity to handle the statewide programs.” The recommendation to separate lighting, HVAC, and PLA is in part an acknowledgement of the vendors behind the manufacturing and distribution of these products. A review of the manufacturers and distributors for HVAC technologies revealed duplicative vendors within a technology family, leading PG&E to conclude there may be a “natural bundling” of HVAC (both residential and commercial), and that the vendors behind other technologies, such as lighting operate independently. Please see **attachment** “Atch1\_TURN\_01\_UpMid\_Program\_Partners\_Q09” for an example of this analysis. The recommendations put forth by the IOUs would support a streamlined approach for delivering products to market, taking into consideration the relationships with vendors, and expertise in specific technology areas. PG&E did not conduct any other research or analysis to inform its recommendations for “natural bundling.”

c. The data used was based on 2015 IOU-reported gross savings.