# California Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee (CAEECC) Goals, Roles & Responsibilities, and Ground-rules

# Adopted by CAEECC-February 15, 2018

# -Amended 8/2/18 with CAEECC Membership Criteria/Process [See Appendix A]

# -Further amended to account for changes agreed to by CAEECC at 11/21/2019 and 2/27/20 full CAEECC meetings

# -Further amended to account for changes agreed to by CAEECC at 3/17/2021 full CAEECC meetings

# -Appendix A was corrected (2019 version swapped in replacing the outdated 2018 Appendix A) on 5/17/2021

# -Further amended Section VII.E per guidance from ED on 7/12/2021

# -Further amended Section III.E per 9/2/2021 full CAEECC approval

1. **Goals of the Coordinating Committee**
   1. Support the development and expansion of high-quality energy-efficiency programs that reduce greenhouse-gas emissions in line with state climate and energy goals while responding to customer needs and market dynamics
   2. Provide meaningful and useful input to the Program Administrators (PAs) in the development and implementation of their energy-efficiency business plans
   3. Improve collaboration and communication among parties and with the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) on energy-efficiency matters
   4. Resolve disagreements among stakeholders whenever possible to reduce the number of matters that need to be litigated before the CPUC

# CAEECC Meeting Types

* 1. **Full CAEECC Meetings** — These are formal meetings of the entire CAEECC membership convened to discuss on-going as well as periodic issues of broad interest to CAEECC Members. The Full CAEECC Meetings will be scheduled at least quarterly, and otherwise as needed, in person or via conference call. The public will be given an opportunity to provide input periodically as time allows and at the discretion of the facilitator.
  2. **CAEECC Working Group and Subcommittee Meetings** — These are dedicated meetings of CAEECC Members or their proxy/designees whose organizations are interested in specific topics of importance identified by the CAEECC (or the CPUC) for which CAEECC advice or recommendations are sought. Subcommittees, if any, will generally be focused on sector- specific issues. Working Groups will generally be focused on non sector-specific issues. The public will be given an opportunity to provide input periodically as time allows and at the discretion of the facilitator.
  3. **Ad Hoc CAEECC Workshops** — These are generally one-off workshops on issues identified by the CPUC or CAEECC where broader public input is desired. There will generally be greater time allocated for public input at these workshops than typically allocated at other CAEECC meetings. Seeking formal CAEECC advice or recommendations is not an expected focus of these workshops.

# CAEECC Roles and Responsibilities

* 1. **Coordinating Committee Members** (and their proxies/designees):
     1. Attendance:
        1. Make every attempt to attend all Full CAEECC meetings (in person preferred)
        2. Participate in all Working Group and Subcommittee meetings and Ad Hoc Workshops on topics of interest, by direct Member attendance or through a proxy or a designee
        3. Be on time to meetings and workshops
     2. At Meetings/Workshops:
        1. Come prepared to discuss agenda items (by reviewing all documents disseminated prior to the meeting, conferring with your organization and other colleagues, etc.)
        2. Be forthright and communicative about the interests and preferences of your organization and actively seek agreement if CAEECC recommendations/advice are being sought
        3. Be clear so that everyone understands your interests and proposals
        4. Be concise so that everyone who wants to provide input has an opportunity to do so
        5. Minimize electronic distractions during meetings
     3. Between Meetings:
        1. Keep your organizations informed of developments in the CAEECC process
        2. Confer with other Members during meeting breaks and in between meetings, as needed
        3. Notify the Facilitator Team prior to the meeting (by telephone or e-mail) if you or your proxy cannot attend a Full CAEECC meeting
        4. Be responsible for actively tracking Facilitator Team and Co-Chair communications as well as relevant proceedings and policies
        5. Provide input, feedback, and written material when requested by the Facilitation Team or Co-Chairs in a timely manner
        6. Any presenter (Member or their proxy or designee) should have their presentation ready for posting at least five business days prior to the meeting; and presenters should work with the Facilitator Team prior to the posting deadline to help ensure that materials are clear, concise, and on topic
        7. Discuss pertinent matters with the Facilitator Team and Co-Chairs when and if the need arises
     4. CAEECC Membership: Criteria and Process [See Appendix A]

# Facilitator Team

* + 1. Overall Goal: Help design and facilitate a productive and fair CAEECC process
    2. Before Meetings:
       1. Set appropriate meeting agendas based on CAEECC workplan and discussions at prior meetings, in consultation with Co-Chairs, and through soliciting additional input from CAEECC Members
       2. Ensure that agenda items (and discussions) are aligned with CAEECC goals
       3. Work with any and all presenters to help ensure that all meeting materials are available for posting in a timely manner (at least 5 business days prior to meetings), and help ensure that materials are clear, concise, and on topic
       4. Ensure compliance with the CPUC’s CAEECC Conflict of Interest policy both in setting agendas, and that no Conflict of Interest discussions take place at CAEECC
    3. During Meetings:
       1. Ensure that discussions at meetings stay focused on the agenda topics (and on time), and are conducted in an efficient and effective manner
       2. Help foster a constructive forum where diverse points of view are voiced and examined in a professional and balanced way
       3. Facilitate all meetings impartially and in a non-partisan manner, (i.e., not favoring any representative, alternate, or organization over another)
       4. Ensure that individual Members (whether representing an IOU or non-IOU organization) do not dominate the discussion[[1]](#footnote-1)
    4. After Meetings:
       1. Prepare meeting summaries that are sufficiently detailed (capturing agreements, disagreements, important discussions, and clear next steps)
       2. Post all pre/post meeting materials to the common website/calendar (at least 5 business days before/no more than 5 business days after meeting)
    5. On-Going and Periodically:
       1. Work with Co-Chairs and Members to develop an annual workplan (topics, timing, etc.) for: Full CAEECC Meetings; Working Group and Subcommittee Meetings; and Ad Hoc Workshops
       2. Work with Co-Chairs, Members, and CPUC staff outside the regularly scheduled meeting as requested and/or as needed
       3. Check in with CAEECC Members periodically to make sure the CAEECC process is as effective as possible

## Coordinating Committee Co-Chairs

* + 1. Work with the Facilitator Team (and CAEECC Members) between and during meetings to help:
       1. Develop and propose meeting agendas
       2. Identify and plan for additional Working Groups and Subcommittees and Ad Hoc Workshops, as needed
       3. Identify suitable locations/hosts for each meeting and workshop (alternating between Northern and Southern California at a minimum for the quarterly Full CAEECC meetings)
       4. Coordinate and help seek input from their respective cohorts (e.g., PA or non-PA Members)
       5. Develop an annual CAEECC workplan to be filed by a PA as a Tier 1 Advice Letter in January of each year[[2]](#footnote-2)
    2. Review and approve monthly invoices from the Facilitator Team
    3. Note: Co-Chairs will be approved annually by the Members. If a Co-Chair does not complete his or her term (either voluntarily or as a result of removal by the Members for cause), the Members will need to select a replacement consistent with the groundrules below and the replacement will serve for the duration of the annual term.
  1. **Commission Staff**
     1. Commission Staff must adhere to the “Guidance for Participation in the Coordinating Committee and related sub- committees” as delineated by the Commission in D. 15-10-028, which can be found at the following link: <https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/0c9650_9f5901fce4074e34af1eceea7e262e2f.pdf>
  2. **CAEECC Working Groups Members** 
     1. **All Working Group Members**
        1. Both CAEECC and non-CAEECC Working Group Members will adhere to the CAEECC Roles & Responsibilities and Groundrules, as outlined in this document, or as modified specifically for that Working Group
     2. **Non-CAEECC Members Participating in a Working Group**
        1. *Disclosures*: Non-CAEECC Member organizations participating in a Working Group are required to disclose to the Working Group and the Facilitation Team both a) the entities with whom they are currently doing energy-related business with or for, both currently and within the past year and b) whether they are proposing to represent their own organization or another entity, and if so whom. If new contractual relationships develop during the course of the Working Group, or their representation changes, they will update their disclosures.[[3]](#footnote-3)

## CAEECC Ground-rules on Substantive and Process Issues

* 1. **Substantive Issues (Discussing Issues, Developing Options, and Exploring Agreement)**
     1. The goal of the process is to fully explore substantive issues before the CAEECC, define options, elicit constructive feedback, clarify and narrow points of divergence, seek consensus where feasible, and document points of convergence and any remaining divergence.
     2. During the substantive discussions, if a Member cannot agree with a substantive option under consideration, that member should explain why and propose a specific alternative that he or she can support.
     3. Documentation (e.g., in the high-level meeting summary) of consensus and multiple options on any particular issue would include a clear description of each option and supporting rationale, and include the Members supporting each option.
     4. The intended use of the documentation (e.g., the high level meeting summary) is to serve as a reference document to inform and assist Members (and groups of Members) in preparing formal advice or recommendations to the CPUC, PAs, and others, if they so choose.
     5. All the above ground-rules apply to all Full CAEECC, Working Group, Workshops, and Subcommittee meetings. However, unless the CAEECC previously agreed at a Full CAEECC meeting that the particular Working Group, Workshops, or Subcommittee was delegated to complete the deliberations on behalf of the Full CAEECC on those specific issues, any options devised or consensus agreement - if any - would come back to the full CAEECC to review, refine if need be, and finalize. Each Prospectus (see Section VI) will specify, on a case-by-case basis, whether the full CAEECC will retain final recommendation-making authority or delegate it to a Working Group, Workshop, or Subcommittee.
  2. **Process Issues**
     1. For any **significant process-related issues** (including the annual selection (or removal) of Co-Chairs, whether or not to launch a CAEECC Working Group, Work Group, or Subcommittee on a particular topic, approval of new Members, and changes to groundrules, etc.) the goal would again be to reach a consensus. However, if a consensus is not achieved in a timely fashion, a decision can be made if (a) a quorum (defined as the presence - in person or over the phone - of a Member or Proxy of ¾ of Member organizations) exists, and (b) 2/3 or more of the CAEECC Members (or their Proxies) present – in person or over the phone – agree.
     2. For secondary **process related issues** (including setting meeting dates, finalizing agenda designs, etc.) the Facilitator Team in consultation with the Co-Chairs, and after seeking input and feedback from CAEECC Members, will have the responsibility to make these decisions.

1. **CAEECC Issue/Topic Selection**
   1. **Non-Discretionary Issues/Topics**:
      1. CPUC has formally directed CAEECC to take on an issue/topic (e.g., through an order);
   2. **Discretionary Issues/Topics**:
      1. Energy Division has identified an important issue/topic and initiated a starting point (e.g., issued a list of key sub-topics and/or questions, or a white paper on a topic); and diversity of opinions on issue (if not significant diversity of opinion should stay with CPUC); or
      2. CAEECC has identified an important issue/topic that it wants to take on, and received feedback from ED on the issue;
      3. For discretionary issues/topics identified either by the CPUC or CAEECC where a new Working Group or Ad Hoc Workshop is proposed and after the opportunity of sharing of perspectives of CAEECC Members, at least 2/3 of CAEECC Member organizations agree that CAEECC should take on, and for a Working Group at least 1/3 of CAEECC Member organizations plan to participate (no minimum participation for Ad Hoc Workshops). (This rule does not cover topics taken on by CAEECC Subcommittees).
2. **Prospectus for Each New Topic**
   1. For any new major topic undertaken by the CAEECC, facilitator and Co-Chair (in consultation w/ED) should develop a **prospectus** including:
      1. Appropriate venue (Full CAEECC meetings, Working Group, Ad Hoc Workshop, or Subcommittee);
      2. Goal (i.e. Education, structured feedback, or consensus-seeking/recommendations)
      3. Timeframe and number of meetings
      4. Expected use of the output/recommendations (e.g., CPUC ruling and comment, information-only)
3. **Enforcement of CAEECC Groundrules, Roles, and Responsibilities**
   1. **CAEECC Members**
      1. Members who feel that a groundrule or role and responsibility is not being properly adhered to by a Member or Co-Chair, should bring the matter directly to the Member/Co-Chair or Members/Co-Chairs of concern and to the Facilitation Team.
      2. Members who feel that a groundrule or role and responsibility is not being properly adhered to by the Facilitation Team, should bring the matter directly to the Facilitation Team and to the Co-Chairs.
      3. In the event that a Member feels that a matter has not been sufficiently addressed after bringing such issue to the Member(s), Facilitation Team, or Co-Chair(s) depending on the situation, the Member can then bring the matter to the Commission (through the lead Energy Division staff member).
   2. **CAEECC Facilitation Team**
      1. Enforce all groundrules; and respond to and endeavor to rectify any Member assertions that other Member(s) (including the Co-Chair(s)) have not followed the groundrules or their respective roles and responsibilities as described in this document.
   3. **CAEECC Co-Chairs**
      1. Respond to and endeavor to rectify Member(s) assertions that the Facilitation Team has not followed the groundrules or their roles and responsibilities as described in this document.
   4. **Commission Staff**
      1. Address any Member, Co-Chair, or Facilitation Team formal complaint (submitted in writing) regarding another Member, Co-Chair, or Facilitation Team who has not followed the groundrules or their respective roles and responsibilities that has not been rectified directly and sufficiently through the CAEECC processes outlined above. The Commission may address each such formal complaint in a manner chosen by the Commission.
   5. **All Parties**
      1. Members, Co-Chairs, the Facilitation Team and Commission staff are encouraged to document oral conversations about a dispute (once it is raised) in writing to allow for a record of the communications. Information relevant to the dispute shall be shared between the involved parties. [section E.i amended 7/12/2021 per guidance from ED].

The above roles and responsibilities and groundrules will be revisited annually, or as needed.

**Appendix A:**

**CAEECC Membership: Criteria and Process**

**Originally drafted June 6, 2018**

**Amended 8/2/18 and 11/21/2019**

**Criteria for Adding a New Member Organization:**

**For the Member Organization**

* Organizations with substantial demonstrated interest and qualifications on energy efficiency in California
* Documented sponsorship from at least two existing CAEECC Member organizations

**For the individual lead Member and any alternate Proxy from the Member Organization**

* A detailed understanding of and working familiarity with CA’s EE policies including its cost-effectiveness framework
* Agreement to abide by all the CAEECC roles and responsibilities for Members and by the CAEECC groundrules
  + Ability to attend all Full CAEECC Meetings (in person) [Note: Can send proxy from organization on occasion in Member can not attend]; and willingness to attend CAEECC Working Groups and Ad Hoc Workshops on topics of interest to your organization
* Specific prior experience working collaboratively in other stakeholder processes [Note this was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 4Q2019 Quarterly Meeting]

**Process for Adding a New Member Organization:**

1. CAEECC Facilitator posts criteria on CAEECC website for CAEECC membership and the CAEECC Member selection process
2. CAEECC Facilitator periodically notifies interested stakeholders when there are openings in the CAEECC (by informing CAEECC Members of posting on the website, and potentially notifying the CAEECC list serve)
3. Interested potential Member organizations will be required to submit a short application to the CAEECC Facilitator, including the following:
   1. Name of proposed Member organization including names and titles of the lead Member and any alternate Proxy
   2. Briefly explain how the organization and proposed lead Member and any alternate Proxy satisfy all of the criteria described above (interest, qualifications, knowledge of CA EE policy and cost-effectiveness framework, and ability to abide by all the CAEECC roles and responsibilities and groundrules)
   3. Describe specific prior experience working collaboratively in other stakeholder processes [Note 3c was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 4Q2019 Quarterly Meeting]
   4. Any new Member nomination must have the sponsorship of at least two existing CAEECC Members [Note 3d was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 4Q2019 Quarterly Meeting]
4. In assessing whether to accept a new Member, CAEECC Members should consider the following factors: A) how well the Member meets all of the Membership criteria outlined above; B) overall size of the CAEECC (e.g., in the 20-25 Member range); C) the composition of the CAEECC as a whole, (i.e., so that there’s reasonable balance among the different stakeholder interests and that there’s not redundancy of interests among Members); and D) avoid overly duplicative Membership on the CAEECC (e.g., an umbrella organization plus separately several of its organizational members.) [Note 4D was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 4Q2019 Quarterly Meeting]
5. CAEECC Facilitator compiles applications and annually circulates application letters to Full CAEECC for their consideration (either at a regularly-scheduled CAEECC meeting or some other process agreed to by the CAEECC), along with an initial proposal based on the criteria above for Member discussion and approval
6. After discussion by the CAEECC, facilitator will attempt to get a consensus of the Members present within the allotted time on the disposition of each new Member application (defined as unanimity). If there is no consensus of the Members present, then the CAEECC will vote on each new Member application—and a minimum of ¾ of the total Membership are needed to approve the new Member [Note this #6 was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 8/2/18 meeting]
7. Periodically (i.e., every other year) the CAEECC should consider whether important broad stakeholder clusters are missing from current CAEECC make-up—e.g., an organization specializing in social justice issues [Note #7 was added after discussion and agreement from Members present at the 4Q2019 Quarterly Meeting]

**Process for Changing leads and alternates from a CAEECC Member organization:**

1. CAEECC Facilitator annually checks with then current individual lead Members as to whether they wish to discontinue representing their organization in the CAEECC (i.e., an opt out process), and if so whether they are proposing that someone else from their organization will take their place
2. Besides the annual check-in, CAEECC Member organizations should let the   
   Facilitator know of proposed changes to their representation as they arise.

**Criteria for Removing an Existing Member Organization**:

An Existing CAEECC Member organization can be removed from the CAEECC

* If its representatives/alternates are not regularly attending (in person or via phone) Full CAEECC meetings (i.e., 2 or more of past 4 meetings) unless there are extenuating circumstances; or
* If it has an insurmountable conflict of interest arise (as determined by ED)

1. D.15-10-028, p.75 [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. D.15-10-028, p.74 [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Note to CAEECC: This proposed Groundrule was piloted with the new Metrics Working Groups; it is now being moved for full CAEECC approval. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)